

## **BOARD OF DIRECTORS**

*This meeting was facilitated both in-person and via an online Zoom format.*

**Wednesday, October 30, 2024**

**2:30 p.m.**

**BMU 205**

**Members Present:** Chris Sullivan, Jamie Clyde, Aishwarya Gowda, Dr. Tracy Butts, Rishika Tyagi, Dr. Isaac Brundage, Dev Kachiwala, Aaron Schwartz

**Members Absent:** Jaiden Grivette

**Others Present:** Jon Simmons, Thang Ho, Shar Krater, Eliza Miller (Recording), Kendra Wright, Leah Mercer, Tom Rider, Katrina Leach, Keith Crawford, Emily Berry, Kyle Alsberry, Gia Monticello, A din White, Brooke McCall, Erika Guerra, Chuy Rojas Rivas, Steve Novo, Windy Van Dam, Zion Fozo, Kaylee McAllister-Knutson, Kendall Ross, Delanie Love, Chris Navarrete, Richard Oliver, Brooklyn Briggs, Katey Von Mosch, Anna Paladini, Dominic Almonte, Kevin Gil, Brooke McCall, Maxwell Freedman, C. Nicholas Kepler, Charlie Foor, Christina Jewell, Colin Chambers, Kristin Chelotti, Sarah Wilson, Kim Canisso.

**CALL TO ORDER** – The Chair, Sullivan, called the meeting to order at 2:36pm

- I. **MECHOOPDA LAND RECOGNITION** - The meeting started with reading the Mechoopda Land Recognition Statement.
- II. **AGENDA** – Approval of the 10/30/24 Regular Meeting Agenda. **Action Requested: Motion to approve the 10/30/24 Regular Meeting Agenda (Gowda/Tyagi) 8-0-0 MSC. Vote was taken by roll call: Butts-Yea, Gowda – Yea, Kachiwala- Yea, Clyde – Yea, Schwartz- Yea, Brundage- Yea, Tyagi- Yea, Sullivan- Yea.**
- III. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES** – Approval of the minutes of the regular meeting of 10/16/24. **Motion to approve the minutes of the regular meeting of 10/16/24, as presented (Gowda/Schwartz) 8-0-0 MSC. Vote was taken by roll call: Butts-Yea, Gowda – Yea, Kachiwala- Yea, Clyde – Yea, Schwartz- Yea, Brundage- Yea, Tyagi- Yea, Sullivan- Yea.**
- IV. **ANNOUNCEMENTS**—Sullivan shared some ground rules for the meeting including how to indicate you would like to speak.
- V. **PUBLIC OPINION** –
- VI. **STANDING COMMITTEE REPORTS** – Action Items forwarded to the Board of Directors from the standing committees stand approved unless overturned by a 2/3 + 1 Board action.
  - A. Government Affairs Committee  
GAC Actions of 10/23/24
    - a. Approved the 10/23/24 regular meeting agenda
    - b. Approved Minutes of the 10/9/24 regular meetings, as presented.
    - c. Approved 2025 AS Election Procedures (attached, page 11).
    - d. **2024-25 Associated Students Committee/Council Appointments**
      - Confirmation of appointment to Associated Students Facilities Committee (ASFC)  
Government Affairs Committee Appointment: Ashley Arce
      - Confirmation of appointment to Associated Students Businesses Committee (ASBC)  
Government Affairs Committee Appointment: Kareena Siganporia
  - B. Associated Students Facilities Committee  
ASFC Actions of 10/24/24
    - a. Approved the 10/24/25 Regular Meeting Agenda
    - b. Approved the 4/25/24 Meeting Minutes

- c. Approved the Resolution for Establishing Time and Location for Associated Students Facilities Committee Meetings for Academic Year 2024-2025

C. Associated Students Businesses Committee

No Meeting Held – Tyagi shared that her first meeting is coming up on November 15 at 11:00 am.

## VII. BUSINESS

- A. Action Item: Approve Revisions to AS Corporate Codes: AS Signature Policy. **Motion requested: Approve Revisions to AS Corporate Codes: AS Signature Policy (Schwartz/Gowda)8-0-0 MSC Vote was taken by roll call: Butts-Yea, Gowda – Yea, Kachiwala- Yea, Clyde – Yea, Schwartz- Yea, Brundage- Yea, Tyagi-Yea, Sullivan- Yea.**
- B. **Discussion Item: Fraternity and Sorority Affairs Evaluation of Executive Vice President.** Chair Sullivan invited Maxwell Friedman to the table to share some sentiments on behalf of the Interfraternity Greek Council, the Multicultural Greek Council, and the College Panhellenic Council. –

*My name is Maxwell Freedman. I'm a member of Ta Kappa Epsilon, and I am standing here as a representative from the Interfraternity Council and speaking on behalf of the Multicultural Greek Council and the College Panhellenic Council. And I bring to the AS Board of Directors two matters. Firstly, I'm calling on the AS Board of Directors to consider the amendment of the AS Bylaws, article X, section 3, Removal of Officers. And secondly, the Greek community would like to use this amendment to pursue the impeachment of Executive Vice President Aaron Schwartz. To begin in the current state, The AS Bylaws of article X, section three reads: "subject to the rights, if any, of an officer under any contract of employment, any officer other than the President and Chair of the Board, the Secretary and the Chief Financial Officer, may be removed with or without cause by the board at any regular or special meeting of the board, except in this case of an officer chosen by the board, by an officer on whom such power of removal may be conferred by the board." IFC, MGC and CPC are calling for this article to be amended to permit the impeachment of any and all Associated Students Board of Directors, we feel that as student elected officials of. Student body, if there is a reason for impeachment, we the student body should be able to remedy this issue with the ability to remove an official from office, regardless of whether Executive Vice President Aaron Schwartz's actions are deemed as for impeachment. From the perspective of a member of the student body, to have the ability to impeach any elected official is critical to achieve the student... to achieve a student government in which students are most adequately represented. We must follow the footsteps of our national government our constitution. We have the right to impeach any elected official, and it should be no different for our own student government. For these reasons, I urge you to amend the AS bylaw, article X, section three, removal of officers. Now moving on to the matter of regard regarding Executive Vice President Aaron Schwartz, me and several other students have already sent our concerns to the Board of Directors in an email listing the failures of the Executive Vice President to fulfill his duties stated in the Code of Ethics established by this Associated Students. But, to list some of them, some of the failures are accuracy of information, Executive Vice President Aaron Schwartz has made false claims at an open forum, which has led to detrimental policy changes. He has also verbally claimed that all students are mad at the current new protocol, which is not true, and the Greek community is very against, very against the new tabling protocol, as well as other things. "Responsibility; Members will act without hesitation, responsibility for their own actions," and we feel that Aaron Schwartz has failed to do so, to take responsibility for the false claims that he has made when the ISC, MGC and CPC members asked him if he had any active role to overturn the new tabling protocol, Aaron got offensive and even mentioned leaving the room slash meeting. Additionally, "members not engage in the conduct that involves dishonest in intentional deception, misrepresentation or unlawful discrimination," as listed before, we feel as though he has failed to abide by this through his actions and his words. And, the list continues to go on, and if you would like to see the email, I will happily send it to you. And so overall, we feel that we need to first make this change to the bylaws so that we can accurately, accurately represent the student body by impeachment. And then to follow up, we would like to pursue actions to impeach Executive Vice President Aaron Schwartz. Thank you for your time.*

- C. Discussion Item: 3/31/24 and 6/30/24 Student Union and Auxiliary Activities Capital Expenditure Reports.- Leach shared that capital expenditures are items over 5,000 and with a life of over 1 year. Leach first revised the student union capital expenditures from the third and fourth quarters of last year. These included AV upgrades

for the auditorium and the replacement of the MAC court floor in the WREC. For auxiliary business, there were a couple of approved capital projects, but no funds were spent during the reported quarters.

- D. Discussion Item: 6/30/24 Combined Student Union and WREC/AO Summary Income and Expense Summary – Leach shared that this report reflects the final June numbers for the union fee. Income ended at 98% to budget. Expenses ended at 87.21% for the year.
- E. Discussion Item: Activity Fee Budget vs Actual June 2024 – Wright shared that as of June 2024 the Activity Fee ended at 72.85% of the original budget.
- F. Director of Academic Affairs Report—Kachiwala shared that he is currently returning from the Graduation initiative symposium in Los Angeles. He has also been holding his 1:1's with the Student Academic Senator.
- I. Director of Social Justice and Equity Report—Gowda shared that the special action team hosted their final listening session today. She also announced the Multicultural showcase and Cultural Fashion Show are coming up soon.
- J. University Vice Presidents' Reports—Dr. Brundage shared that he and Dev had a wonderful time at the Graduation Initiative 2025 Symposium. He expressed excitement about coming back to share all the things they had learned. He added that Student Affairs is focused on enrollment for spring and fall.

Clyde shared that she was also at the graduation Initiative 2025 conference. She shared that Title IX training is a requirement for students and encouraged them to reach out to better understand the processes. They are also looking to move the Title IX office out of Kendall into the SSC. She shared that UBC will be having its next meeting on Tuesday, November 5<sup>th</sup>. She added that she is always willing to sit down with folks to help them understand the budget.

- K. Faculty Representative Report – Dr. Butts gave Sullivan some encouragement and praised his skills running a large meeting. She also discussed efforts in Academic affairs to address budget concerns through course adjustments now registration appointments are out. If you have concerns about courses, please communicate with your advisors and department Staff. She shared additional wisdom about grading policies with the table and encouraged the students to take a real assessment of how they are performing.
  - L. Executive Director's Report—Clyde shared that tomorrow is Halloween, and Coffee and Kudos is starting at 11 am, come out and support the AS group costume. The AS is still working on acquiring a beer and wine license. She also shared that Dining will be bringing a consultant to the BOD to discuss some potential next steps for our Dining Services. She shared that the immediate Access trial this semester. She encouraged everyone to cast their vote in the national election next Tuesday. The Auditorium will be a voting center for the election.
  - M. President's Report—Sullivan thanked IFC and FSA for taking the time to address the Board today. Sullivan requested that The AS Executive Director and Associate Executive Director take this opportunity to update the Code of Ethics and incorporate an equitable Code of Conduct into the Bylaws. Sullivan shared that he attended CSSA in Monterey Bay with the Commissioner of Legislative Affairs. He shared that he and Director Tyagi have been participating in the UBC training and have learned much about the University's budget process. He shared that the Academic Senate will discuss Time, Place, and Manner at their meeting on Thursday. He reminded the students that he is always taking input from the team for his meetings with President Perez, so please share what they hear. He shared that Moonlight Safety Stroll yesterday hosted over 100 participants and was a great event combining members of campus and the Chico community.
- VIII. ANNOUNCEMENTS**—Schwartz shared that the Ballot Bash will be hosted on election day in Trinity Commons. Additionally, the Office of Civic Engagement will have office hours this Thursday to help people with questions about the ballot. He also shared that AS Skate Spooktacular is being hosted in the WREC on Halloween night. Schwartz also encouraged everyone to participate in the planning process. Clyde shared that AS Dining recently hosted Bug Night, and she wanted to shout out a fun event. Sullivan shared that he is presenting in the BRC tonight at an event about voting.
- IX. PUBLIC OPINION**—Zion Fozo was recognized and shared the following statement: *I just want to start by thanking the Board of Directors for their time. And I want to let you all know that I speak with an impassioned desire to keep*

*Executive Vice President Aaron Schwartz as the EVP. The AS is remarkable because we have a means of holding our elected officials accountable for the things that they do, inside and outside of office, then this is, of course, a benefit to our democratic process as an institution. I'd like to say that, if EVP Schwartz is impeached, what happens to the people who impeached him? If he's not, what happens to those people? The answer is nothing. Nothing is done in order to hold them accountable for doing things like speaking to President Perez or the Orion. There's no way to hold them accountable for having resources being spent on this meeting that could have been spent actually furthering the goal of keeping unrecognized fraternities and sororities off campus. If we want to further that goal, we could easily do so. The current tabling policy gives Student Life and Leadership and the IFC privy rights to organizations from campus if they are predatory to students. We already have that right, and if we want to talk about the impeachment process and creating that process of the 19% of students who voted in this election, the email talks about that there's 8% of people in Greek life. So even if all 8% voted in the AS election, that would still not be enough to overturn the other 11% of people who voted for EVP Schwartz. I think it's worth it to analyze how this is not the first time that they have supported this policy. Time, Place, and Manner was rushed into the CSU as a response to Palestinian protests, and in doing so, Time, Place and Manner has an addendum where you can get a misdemeanor if you refuse to leave campus or refuse to leave your spot. We here at Chico State, enjoy the privilege of being a public university. I can walk right downtown to Celestino's right after this meeting, I probably will, largely because if we wanted this university to stay public, to stay connected to the city of Chico, what's your call? If we really wanted to keep, you know, non, unrecognized, non-lettered organizations off campus, I say at this point, build a moat. There's nothing that we can do to keep people off our campus that will meaningfully impact them. And what happens when we need to protest again? What happens if tuition is increases, more people dying in Gaza? What happens when we need to protest and use our voice, use our First Amendment rights? The university can say, "Well, you didn't reserve your spot. You're not leaving. You're protesting an improper manner. Misdemeanor for you." I don't think that students should, should get a misdemeanor for just speaking their mind and peaceful protest. Thank you.*

*Adin White was recognized and shared the following statement: I just wanted to clarify legitimating the concerns expressed today and also in the emails, I think there's things that need to be addressed. And especially, I think also, I just wanted to point out that I really commend the efforts of everyone who was concerned about the... this policy having been repealed. I have not seen such like, concerted effort to make student voices heard. I've been trying to get people to be that engaged myself, and it's, like, really hard, and so I think that's cool. But I... I just want to say that, like, these things should be addressed with policy change. And I don't know that, like, like, Aaron doesn't have any control over this policy. He didn't in the beginning, and I think when he was there, he was critiquing the policy and the people implementing it. And as to the concerns addressed in the document, I think like about what he said specifically, like if those things are demonstrably true, I think that's definitely concerning. But I hope there's like, a transcript available, and if there isn't, then maybe in the future, we should really try to make sure those kinds of important meetings are recorded and like transcripts are available. So you know, if anything comes, I mean, only even just to, like, have them for when people are, like, taking into consideration student feedback. So it's not just like notes, it's like, we go back to exactly what was said when it was said, and what the context in which you said was. So yeah, I think again, I just want to reiterate that Aaron didn't have the authority to change the policy, nor did he have the authority to repeal the policy. And I don't really remember, I was only there for the second half, but I remember him calling for the policy to be repealed. I think he just had point-by-point critiques. And I think that the repeat, like, the full full-on repealing of the policy is what has created the really, like, dangerous situation that has been talked a lot about, which, again, I think those are very legitimate concerns. So I think Aaron was there kind of arguing on behalf of student rights, and I think that's his job, and he was echoing the sort of concerns expressed by students in that meeting. Then that was I was there for the second half, and I only heard people being critical of the policy. I didn't hear anyone in support of the policy. That's that's there. But I also want to say that I agree with the IFC, that the matter of policies governing student expression, like the tabling policy that was repealed following the forum, should involve much more student consultation. It should not be the kind of thing where, you know, 8% of the student body doesn't like hear about it, or isn't able to be involved in that conversation, and so, you know, or they're, like, not aware that the... that process is going on. So, I would be happy to work with anyone interested in creating these kinds of policy changes that would prevent this sort of dangerous situation from going on any longer than it needs to. And honestly, I think Aaron would have been happy to work with people on this too. So that's, that's all I have to say.*

Kaylee McAllister-Knutson shared that Kendall Ross has been announced as the permanent Senior Director of Student Life & Leadership and Recreational Sports.

Shar Krater shared that Jose Hernandez is on campus for a meet and greet today before his event tonight at Laxson Auditorium, which students can still get free tickets to. She also shared that CAVE hosted a great Make a Difference Day.

Chuy Rojas Rivas thanked the BOD for allowing FSA students to come to share their sentiments today. He is hopeful that the AS Elected Representatives will consider the safety concerns shared by the Greek students, such as recruitment, and work together to create a new protocol that works for all student organizations.

**X. ADJOURNMENT** – The Chair, Sullivan, adjourned the meeting at 3:36 p.m.