

## **BOARD OF DIRECTORS**

*This meeting was facilitated both in-person and via an online Zoom format*

**Wednesday, May 3, 2023**

**2:30 p.m.**

**BMU 205**

**Members Present:** Krystal Alvarez, Jade Tsao, Johnathan Montes, Michelle Davis, Autumn Alaniz-Wiggins, Dr. Tracy Butts, Allison Wagner, Jamie Clyde, Dr. Isaac Brundage

**Members Absent:** None

**Others Present:** Curtis Sicheneder, Karen Bang (recording), Hugh Hammond, Kendra Wright, Katrina Robertson, Thang Ho, Tom Rider, Jon Slaughter, Lexi Extein, Keith Crawford, Saul Garfia, Etta Stewart, Anna Paladini, Kristina Bargr, Katey VonMosch, Brooklyn Briggs, Katalina Rodriguez, Windy Van Dam, Teresa Clements, Amanda Dubner, Owen Cross, Brendan Ivey, Emily Vanness, Jenna Walker, Michael Athan Trippett, Roland McNutt, Breand Locke-Knight, Alex Sorger, Shar Krater, Leah Mercer, Brooke McCall,

- I. **CALL TO ORDER** – The Chair, Alvarez, called the meeting to order at 2:33 p.m.
- II. **MECHOOPDA LAND RECOGNITION** – The meeting was started with the reading of the Mechoopda Land Recognition Statement.
- III. **AGENDA** – Approval of the 5/3/23 Special meeting agenda. **Motion to approve the 5/3/23 Special meeting agenda (Wagner/Montes) 7-0-0 MSC.**
- IV. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES** – Minutes of the 4/12/23 regular Board meeting. **Motion to approve the minutes of the 4/12/23 regular Board meeting, as presented (Tsao/Alvarez) 7-0-0 MSC.**
- V. **ANNOUNCEMENTS** – None
- VI. **PUBLIC OPINION** – Limited to items on the agenda, three minutes per speaker, five minutes for entire topic – Roland McNutt will speak at later Public Opinion.
- VII. **STANDING COMMITTEE REPORTS** – Action Items forwarded to the Board of Directors from the standing committees stand approved unless overturned by a 2/3 + 1 Board action.
  - A. Government Affairs Committee – Tsao reviewed the items approved by the GAC.
    1. GAC Actions of 4/19/23
      - a. Approved the 4/19/23 regular meeting agenda.
      - b. Approved the 4/5/23 regular meeting minutes.
      - c. Approved the Activity Fee Fund Budget, estimated results 2022-23 and proposed budget 2023-24, as presented with modifications that reinstate the contract programs to only a 20% reduction in annual allocations for 2023-24.
      - d. Approved revisions to Associated Students Corporate Codes – Duties for the Director of Social Justice and Equity, effective beginning the 2023-24 elected representative term, as presented.
    2. GAC Actions of 4/26/23
      - a. Approved the 4/26/23 Special meeting agenda.
      - b. Approved the 4/19/23 regular meeting minutes.
      - c. Approved Revisions to Associated Students Corporate Codes: Revenue Sharing Policy.
      - d. Approved confirmation of appointments to the 2023 AS Scholarship Committee – Executive Vice President Appointments: Krystal Alvarez, Chloe Renner and Gianna Echavez-LaRocca, as presented.
  - B. Associated Students Facilities Committee – Davis reviewed the items approved by the ASFC.
    1. ASFC Actions of 4/14/23
      - a. Approved the 4/14/23 regular meeting agenda.
      - b. Approved the minutes of the 3/30/23 regular meeting, as presented.

- c. Approved Student Union Budget (including Capital Expenditures), estimated results 2022-23 and proposed budget 2023-24, with modifications as presented: A 10% student wage reduction for all Union departments (\$50,000), the elimination of travel and professional development (\$50,000), Adventure Outings reductions which include: freezing the program coordinator position (\$70,000), reducing student labor (\$67,745), trips income reinstated (\$46,700), reduce non-labor operating budget (\$21,375), reduce program director to an 11-month position (\$5,854), along with the WREC facility hours reduced by 8 hours a week (\$66,105), freeze floating custodial position (\$33,218), and additional student wage reductions as follows: WELL student labor (\$3,566), WREC student labor (maintenance) (\$9,446), AS Marketing & Design student labor (\$5,708), along with WREC small equipment budget reduction (\$50,000) and OPS programming reduction (\$20,000), with the total impact being \$499,717. Wagner said she'd like to discuss this further during the Budget item (Business Item A.)
- 2. ASFC Actions of 4/28/23
  - a. Approved the 4/28/23 regular meeting agenda.
  - b. Approved minutes of the 4/7/23 and 4/14/23 regular meetings.
  - c. Approved an AS staff lunchroom in BMU 211.
  - d. Approved revisions to Associated Students Corporate Codes - Sustainability Fund Allocation Policy, as presented.
  - e. Approved Golden 1 Credit Union exploring rental of space in BMU for standalone ATM.
- C. Associated Students Businesses Committee – Montes reviewed the approved items. (Dr. Brundage joined the meeting at 2:42 p.m.)
  - 1. ASBC Actions of 4/17/23
    - a. Approved the 4/17/23 regular meeting agenda.
    - b. Approved the 3/20/23 and 4/3/23 regular meeting minutes.
    - c. Approved Associated Students Auxiliary Businesses Budget – Dining Services (including Capital Expenditures), estimated results 2022-23 and proposed budget 2023-24, as presented.
  - 2. ASBC Actions of 5/1/23
    - a. Approved the 5/1/23 regular meeting agenda.
    - b. Approved the 4/10/23 and 4/17/23 regular meeting minutes. (Dr. Butts joined the meeting at 2:43 p.m.).

## VIII. BUSINESS

- A. Action Item: Approval of Associated Students Budget (including Pay Schedule), estimated results 2022-23 and proposed budget 2023-24 – **Motion to open this Action Item up for discussion (Wagner/Alaniz-Wiggins) 9-0-0 MSC.** Clyde said that before the budget discussion begins that she wanted to make a statement of conflict of interest. She said she would like to fully participate as a Board member during discussions, but wanted it to be well known that she was part of every line item of this budget as AS Executive Director. She explained that she's now sitting at the table as the Interim Vice President for Business and Finance. Clyde said she could abstain but there's a lot of thought and great information that goes into these budgets and she would like to signal to our new president that she supports the budget process regardless of how this conversation goes, so she plans on voting as she believes it supports the AS best to vote. Alaniz--Wiggins spoke regarding the contract programs, specifically CCLC and the STAR Center that receive both Activity Fee and Union Fee contract program allocations. She said the Activity Fee allocation was originally reduced 25% but was revised down to 20%. She said she would like to see the Union fee allocation be reduced down to 20%, instead of 25%, an amount of \$5,050. Page 74 of the proposed budget was displayed and discussed. Alaniz-Wiggins also said regarding the reduction in WREC hours and OPS that programming is something we should continue to invest in and expressed concern regarding the way the hurt was spread in order to keep Adventure Outings (AO). Wagner also expressed concern about program reductions. She said that for students that aren't involved in student clubs or organizations, she is concerned about the WREC hours being cut 8 hours weekly and the effect it will have on them vs. the 146 students of AO. She said the jobs for AO would be reallocated, so no one would lose their jobs, compared to the new reduction where a custodial position would be frozen and the cut hours of the WREC would cut the hours of student employees, in addition to the Marketing & Design student labor cuts. Wagner said it's her duty as a student voice to vote against a budget that hurts more students, just to allow one organization to continue functioning. She said that AO could register as an organization and receive funding. Sicheneder reviewed with the Board the comparison that was prepared for the Associated Students Facilities Committee (ASFC). He said when the original budget was presented, it was met with some angst and staff were asked to prepare a secondary budget. He said what they see here is the difference in reductions of approximately \$500,000. Regarding OPS, he said he and Krater looked at what was spent this year in OPS and decided they could afford a \$20,000 cut in the program. Regarding The Well student labor, he said

this area is new and they didn't know what they didn't know. He said they looked at how the space was used, and carried forward a bit to 2024. He stated that the WREC student maintenance labor and AS Marketing & Design student labor technically will have more student labor dollars in their areas even with the reduction. Regarding the WREC, he said it's open up to 100 hours per week during the academic year, and they would be taking away 8 hours per week. He provided various scenarios for the 8-hour cut. He did note that student employees would feel it a little bit. He said the custodial position will be a loss but is currently vacant so no one will lose their job. Sicheneder said his role as Interim Executive Director is to be a conduit for what the Board does; however, he recommends, what is on the right side of the column. Davis explained why the ASFC voted to pass the modified budget. She said approximately 200 people attended their meeting in support of AO and the committee heard how this program has impacted students. She said she never experienced as much passion for a program at Chico State as she has for AO these past couple of weeks, noting she received over 300 emails from students, alumni, staff and faculty. She said many students said AO is the reason they came to Chico State and stayed, because of the sense of community and belonging they found with AO. Sicheneder said ASFC discussed the AS using conservative enrollment numbers so money is not spent that we don't have. He noted he has never seen such elasticity of the enrollment numbers heading into this fall and it's possible that the numbers will come in better than anticipated. He said it would be terrible to cut a program when we have an opportunity to be better than anticipated. He said this suggested budget should allow them to exist while enrollment is figured out. Wagner said it doesn't seem fair that the loud minority wins vs. the silent majority. Tsao said she loves the WREC and goes there very often; she said they can dissect and pick which hours to take away. Clyde said Sicheneder has valid points about enrollment and the AS has the privilege of substantial reserves; however, they're going quickly. She said enrollment is eating into reserves and the budget that is going forward. She said a third option could be keep both, bringing others up to full capacity, create a subcommittee to give a chance to make sure it's not just one set of voices but a holistic view. She said a particular date would be set to bring this back to the Board. Dr. Brundage said he loves that they're representing the students; however, he doesn't want to kick the can down the street. He said enrollment is key, noting they are looking at how enrollment can be increased. He said Cabinet is looking at some benchmark dates regarding looking at enrollment, and making predictions which provides an opportunity to make financial decisions at benchmark dates. Dr. Butts said there's great value and merit in the second proposal because it strikes a careful and delicate balance in terms of providing funding for things that do get a lot of usage, but protecting those that may not be used often, noting she sees this in her area. She said there are departments that are bigger, but we don't exist independently, there's an eco-system. Dr. Butts cautioned about majority vs minority, explaining that smaller groups are often overlooked because a lot of attention is focused on the majority. She said that AO is important, provides all students with an opportunity, and doesn't want to take that away. Davis thanked the AO supporters for attending today's meeting, stating it shows how meaningful this program is.

Alaniz-Wiggins said she did background research, checking with a lot of programs, expecting more collaboration between AO and other areas and didn't see it. She said all but one of them said they tried and there's not much give with AO of working with their group size, or staff wanting to do outings. She said she's concerned with meeting more diverse needs and it doesn't seem that AO is meeting diverse needs like OPS does. She questioned that if AO continues, how they would be held accountable to being committed to the values of service and diversity to underserved students. Davis said some AO members said they were looking to increase some of their unique users in the fall, such as partnering with more organizations throughout campus. She said they can't do that unless given the opportunity by funding them. Sicheneder said he can't speak to what AO has done with those groups post pandemic; however, what this proposal does in terms of the trips, which is one large component of AO, is that they'll be forced to go from 3-4-5 day trips to 1 to 2 day trips, which would help. He said there would also be opportunities for students due to the scholarship fund (Alvarez passed the gavel to Tsao at 3:15 p.m. and left the room). He said one of the things AO is good at, is their team building and there's an opportunity to do that via ice breaker team building at any point. **Tsao called a five-minute recess at 3:16 p.m. She called the meeting back to order at 3:21 p.m. and passed the gavel to Alvarez.** Clyde said a Special Board meeting could be held;

however, in terms of budget process it's important that this Board votes on a budget. She said the next Board could utilize time to make a decision that feels good for all of the Board by ignoring A and B; they don't need to make these decisions today. Sicheneder said there might be logistical issues by pushing this off to another Board, such as there could be AO trips sold at the start of school that then couldn't happen. Further discussion was held. Alaniz-Wiggins suggested not changing AO from what was approved at ASFC; however; change Union fees to contract programs at a 20% reduction, instead of 25%. Wagner agreed, noting she values the contract programs such as the STAR Center and the CCLC. She said that deserves to stay, even if WREC hours are cut. **Motion to discuss adding back the WREC facility hours and OPS Program in addition to contract programs 20% reduction instead of 25% (Wagner/Montes) 9-0-0 MSC.** Wagner said her main concern is the loss of 8 hours per week at the WREC and the OPS Program reduction as these affect the most students. She said by adding those back in, it would take away her concern and AO could stay. Sicheneder said reserves are healthy at this point but cautioned that they need to be careful to not deplete reserves, otherwise a fee increase would be necessary. Due to enrollment elasticity, he agreed with the amount they'd be going into reserves. Regarding OPS, Krater said there are now only two professional staff instead of three and she feels confident with what they're providing to students and is comfortable with the \$20,000 reduction. Point of order by Alvarez to move this to a vote due to time constraints. **Motion to pass the new proposed budget reduction with the amendment of the contract program 5%, and adding back in the \$66,105 for the reduced 8 hours per week in the WREC (Wagner/Montes) 9-0-0 MSC. Motion to approve Associated Students Budget (including Pay Schedule) estimated results 2022-23 and proposed budget 2023-24 with modifications that reinstate the contract programs to only a 20% reduction in annual allocations for 2023-24, for a total of \$5,050, and adding back WREC facility hours reduction by 8 hours/week for a total of \$66,105, totaling \$71,155 (Montes/Wagner) 9-0-0 MSC.**

- B. Action Item: Approval of revisions to Associated Students Corporate Codes – Duties for the Vice President of Business and Finance, effective beginning the 2023-24 elected representative term. **Motion to approve revisions to Associated Students Corporate Codes – Duties for the Vice President of Business and Finance, effective beginning the 2023-24 elected representative term, as presented (Wagner/Montes) 9-0-0 MSC.**
- C. Information Item: Revisions to Associated Students Corporate Codes:
- Vehicle Usage Policy – Crawford provided an overview of the proposed revisions.
  - Duties for the Director of Social Justice and Equity, effective beginning the 2023-24 elected representative term – Wright summarized the suggested revisions.
- D. Information Item: Revisions to Associated Students Human Resources Policies:
- Volunteers Policy, Policy No. 317 – Mercer said revisions were made after discussions with the AS Risk Manager and the policy would now determine who might, or might not, be covered for Workers' Comp if considered a volunteer.
  - COVID-19 Vaccination Policy, Policy No. 004 – Mercer said these revisions follow the recently updated CSU COVID-19 vaccination policy.
- E. Director of University Affairs Report – Wagner said the next Student Academic Senate meeting will be held Monday and thanked Alaniz-Wiggins for protecting the contract programs. She also thanked all that attended today's meeting, noting that it feels like the Board is making a difference.
- F. Director of SJ&E Report – Alaniz-Wiggins said their last meeting is next week and they will do an overview of all the events they did this past year. She said AAPI Month has started and she's collaborating with various departments. She thanked everyone at the table.
- G. University Vice Presidents' Reports – Dr. Brundage thanked Alvarez for her leadership, noting she has done an excellent job. He congratulated those that are about to graduate and said he's looking forward to working with everyone next year. • Clyde said it's the same table, yet different responsibilities for her, a unique feeling. She said she's thrilled that she gets to be a part of the AS

regardless of what that lens looks like, and couldn't do that without the support of this Board. She said working with the students is one of her favorite things to do and controversy at the table is advocacy at its finest.

- H. Faculty Representative Report – Dr. Butts thanked everyone for a great year, noting it has been a pleasure working with everyone this year.
- I. Interim Executive Director Report – Sicheneder said Tom Rider, Director of Auxiliary Businesses, has been working on a RFP for a Marketplace vendor, as authorized by the Board. He said it would be a breakfast/lunch type environment. Sicheneder said Rider is also doing due diligence with Chartwells, a third party vendor similar to Aramark. He also noted that Rider has reached out to Pepsi regarding extending the Pouring Rights contract for one year.
- J. President Report – Alvarez said two weeks ago she traveled to Washington, DC with other CSU representatives where they spoke with some senators and congress members regarding the importance of the PELL Grant and paths to citizenship for DACA students, especially in the CSU where there are about 10,000 students in the DACA program. She said Academic Senate CSU student members of CSSA will be hosting one of their in-person/hybrid meetings here.

**IX. ANNOUNCEMENTS** – Alvarez said Happy Wednesday. Alaniz-Wiggins said Happy Asian American Pacific Islander Month. Davis said she is hosting a Finals Study Hall on 5/11/23 from 12 to 3 p.m. in BMU 203, open to all CSU students.

**X. PUBLIC OPINION** – Walker, Program Director for Adventure Outings, thanked the Board. She said this year, AO so far has approximately 2,200 participants, which equates to approximately 8,300 participant hours. She said their budget includes equipment rentals and so far this year they've had over 1,800 equipment rentals, and thousands of students use the climbing wall. She said everything changed after the pandemic and noted she would like to work with Alaniz-Wiggins to help make partnerships with programs. Walker said the goal is to keep serving as many students as they can, knows numbers aren't great this year, and wants to make sure they're doing as good of a job as they can. McNutt commended Sicheneder for defending the budget that he inherited.

**XI. ADJOURNMENT** – The Chair, Alvarez, adjourned the meeting at 4 p.m.